NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 517990/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 08/14/2019

SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK COUNTY OF KINGS

RICHARD MIRELL,

Plaintiff,

-against-

ST. GABRIEL AT MARY OF THE MOTHER ROMAN CATHOLIC CHURCH, ROMAN CATHOLIC DIOCESE OF BROOKLYN, JOHN DOE and JANE DOE, RICHARD ROE and JANE ROE, priests, clergy and administrators whose names are unknown to the Plaintiff,

Defendants.

Index No. Date Purchased:

Plaintiff designates **KINGS** County as the place of trial.

The basis of the venue is Defendants' place of business.

**SUMMONS** 

To the above named Defendant(s)

YOU ARE HEREBY SUMMONED to answer the complaint in this action and to serve a copy of your answer, or, if the complaint is not served with this summons, to serve a notice of appearance, on the Plaintiff's Attorney within 20 days after the service of this summons, exclusive of the day of service (or within 30 days after the service is complete if this summons is not personally delivered to you within the State of New York); and in case of your failure to appear or answer, judgment will be taken against you by default for the relief demanded in the complaint.

Dated: New York, New York August 14, 2019

> MICHAEL G. DOWD Attorney for Plaintiff

600 Third Avenue, 15th Floor

New York, NY 10016

(212) 751-1640

### FILED: KINGS COUNTY CLERK 08/14/2019 12:15 PM

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 517990/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 08/14/2019

SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK
COUNTY OF KINGS
-----X
RICHARD MIRELL,

Index No.

Plaintiff,

Date Filed:

-against-

ST. GABRIEL AT MARY OF THE MOTHER ROMAN CATHOLIC CHURCH, ROMAN CATHOLIC DIOCESE OF BROOKLYN, JOHN DOE and JANE DOE, RICHARD ROE and JANE ROE, priests, clergy and administrators whose names are unknown to the Plaintiff,

VERIFIED COMPLAINT

Defendants.

Plaintiff, RICHARD MIRELL, by his attorney, MICHAEL G. DOWD, complaining of Defendants, hereby alleges the following:

## AS AND FOR A FIRST CAUSE OF ACTION

#### (NEGLIGENT SUPERVISION)

- The Plaintiff, RICHARD MIRELL (hereinafter "Plaintiff") was born on April 21,
   1945. He is a resident of the state of California.
- Plaintiff was a Roman Catholic and was a parishioner at Defendant ST.
   GABRIEL AT MARY MOTHER OF THE CHURCH ROMAN CATHOLIC
   CHURCH (hereinafter "ST. GABRIEL"), which is a parish within the Defendant
   DIOCESE OF BROOKLYN.
- 3. Plaintiff was baptized, confirmed, attended mass, and received his sacraments through the Roman Catholic Church.
- 4. Upon information and belief, at all times mentioned herein, the DIOCESE OF BROOKLYN (hereinafter "DIOCESE") was and is a not-for-profit religious

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 517990/2019 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 08/14/2019

corporation organized and existing around and under by virtue of the laws of the State of New York. Its principal headquarters are located in Brooklyn, New York, which is in Kings County.

- 5. Upon information and belief, NICHOLAS ANTHONY DIMARZIO (hereinafter "DIMARZIO") is currently the Roman Catholic Bishop of the DIOCESE.
- Upon information and belief, the Bishop is the Chief Executive Officer of all 6. parishes and parish schools in the DIOCESE and as part of said responsibilities assigned the priests to work in the parishes.
- 7. Upon information and belief, all of DIMARZIO's predecessor(s) were the Chief Executive Officer of all parishes and parish schools in the DIOCESE and as part of said responsibilities assigned the priests to work in the parishes, including HAROLD T. COX (hereinafter "COX"), this includes those Bishops who assigned COX to his parish positions.
- 8. Upon information and belief, at all times mentioned herein, DIMARZIO and his above referenced predecessor Bishops in the Office of the Bishop along with Defendant DIOCESE created the policies and procedures to be followed by priests within the DIOCESE. The Office of the Bishop and Defendant DIOCESE were responsible for investigating complaints against its parish clergy. In this capacity, the Office of the Bishop either directly or through Diocesan officials appointed by them, established policies and procedures by which complaints of sexual abuse against parish clergy, priests, and staff were to be dealt with and investigated by the DIOCESE.
- 9. Upon information and belief, at all times mentioned herein, the Office of the

2

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 517990/2019 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 08/14/2019

Bishop was also responsible for removing and/or suspending parish clergy and priests from their duties.

- Upon information and belief, at all times mentioned herein, COX was a pastor of 10. Defendant ST. GABRIEL having been assigned and otherwise authorized to work there by the Office of the Bishop.
- Upon information and belief, Defendant ST. GABRIEL is a Roman Catholic 11. parish church within the DIOCESE.
- Sometime after Plaintiff became a member of the parish in approximately 1955, 12. COX began a pattern of grooming Plaintiff for the purpose of sexually abusing him. This grooming included but was not limited to giving Plaintiff special attention and offering to provide him counseling after Plaintiff's parents divorced and his grandmother died.
- COX's abuse of Plaintiff began in approximately 1955 and continued through 13. approximately 1959. The abuse included, but was not limited to COX fondling and groping Plaintiff's genitals, COX fondling and groping Plaintiff's genitals while his naked, erect penis was exposed to Plaintiff, and COX humping Plaintiff's body in an effort to simulate intercourse while pressing his erect penis against Plaintiff's body. The instances of abuse occurred in the following locations: the visiting room, the kitchen, COX's rectory bedroom, and the confessional of Defendant ST. GABRIEL. Plaintiff estimates the abuse occurred on at least 100 separate occasions.
- Upon information and belief, at all times mentioned herein, Defendant DIOCESE 14. knew or should have known that children such as Plaintiff were present in parish

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 517990/2019 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 08/14/2019

rectories for a variety of purposes, including counseling and work and that priests also took overnight trips with young children parishioners such as Plaintiff.

- 15. Upon information and belief, sometime in 2019 a list of those credibly accused of child sexual abuse was released by the DIOCESE, COX was included on that list. The fact that COX was included on that list of credibly accused priests is an admission by Defendant DIOCESE that COX sexually abused minors.
- 16. Upon information and belief, Plaintiff was taught and otherwise informed by Defendants DIOCESE and ST. GABRIEL by word and deed that he should obey, trust, and respect the DIOCESE and COX.
- 17. Upon information and belief, since at least 1950 through present, Defendants DIOCESE and ST. GABRIEL knew the risk of sexual abuse of minor parishioners by priests and other staff working in the DIOCESE.
- 18. Upon information and belief, at all times mentioned herein, Defendants DIOCESE and ST. GABRIEL knew that minors sexually abused in the Catholic Church would suffer psychological and emotional injuries, as well as other damages.
- Upon information and belief, at all times mentioned herein, Defendant DIOCESE 19. aided and abetted the concealment of criminal conduct by failing and refusing to report allegations of child sexual abuse to appropriate New York civil authorities.
- 20. Upon information and belief, at the time of the acts alleged herein, COX was an employee of, and acting as an agent of Defendants DIOCESE and ST. GABRIEL.
- 21. Upon information and belief, Defendants DIOCESE and ST. GABRIEL had a duty to protect Plaintiff as a minor parishioner from COX's criminal sexual acts.

4

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 517990/2019 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 08/14/2019

22. Upon information and belief, Defendants DIOCESE and ST. GABRIEL failed to adequately and completely supervise COX and as a result of this failure and negligence, proximately caused Plaintiff to be sexually abused by COX.

- 23. The aforementioned occurrences of sexual abuse were caused by the negligence, carelessness, recklessness, and the willful, wanton, reckless and grossly negligent conduct of Defendants DIOCESE and ST. GABRIEL and their agents, servants, and/or employees, in failing to properly and adequately supervise the conduct of COX as it related to Plaintiff.
- 24. By reason of the foregoing, Plaintiff sustained physical and psychological injuries, including but not limited to, severe emotional distress, confusion, humiliation, fright, anxiety, a severe shock to his nervous system, and has been caused to suffer physical pain and mental anguish, emotional and psychological damages as a result thereof, and, upon information and belief, some or all of these injuries are of a permanent and lasing nature; and that Plaintiff as a result has become and will continue to be obligated to expend sums of money for medical expenses for treatment of said maladies.
- 25. That by reason of the foregoing, Defendants DIOCESE and ST. GABRIEL are also liable to Plaintiff for punitive and exemplary damages.
- 26. It is hereby alleged pursuant to CPLR 1603 that the foregoing cause of action is exempt from the operation of CPLR 1601 by reason of one or more of the exemptions provided in CPLR 1602, including but not limited to, CPLR 1602(7) and 1602(11).
- 27. That the amount of damages sought exceeds the jurisdictional limits of all lower

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 517990/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 08/14/2019

courts, which would otherwise have jurisdiction.

# AS AND FOR A SECOND CAUSE OF ACTION

### (NEGLIGENT FAILURE TO WARN)

- 28. Plaintiff repeats, reiterates, and realleges each and every allegation contained in the above paragraphs of this Complaint, with the same force and effect as if fully set forth at length herein.
- 29. Upon information and belief, prior to and at all times herein mentioned, Defendants DIOCESE and ST. GABRIEL and their agents, servants, and employees, knew or should have known that COX violated DIOCESE and ST. GABRIEL's relevant rules, regulations and protocols prohibiting priests like COX from sexually abusing and otherwise harming minor parishioners, including Plaintiff.
- 30. The Defendants DIOCESE and ST. GABRIEL and their agents, servants, and employees were negligent, careless and reckless and acted willfully, wantonly and were grossly negligent in failing to warn Plaintiff that the failure of COX to abide by DIOCESE and ST. GABRIEL's rules, regulations and protocols regarding prohibitions on employees being alone with minor parishioners put Plaintiff at risk for being sexually abused by COX.
- By reason of the foregoing, Plaintiff sustained physical and psychological 31. injuries, including but not limited to, severe emotional distress, confusion, humiliation, fright, anxiety, a severe shock to his nervous system, and has been caused to suffer physical pain and mental anguish, emotional and psychological damages as a result thereof, and, upon information and belief, some or all of these

INDEX NO. 517990/2019

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 08/14/2019

> injuries are of a permanent and lasing nature; and that Plaintiff as a result has become and will continue to be obligated to expend sums of money for medical expenses for treatment of said maladies.

- 32. That by reason of the foregoing, Defendants DIOCESE and ST. GABRIEL are also liable to Plaintiff for punitive and exemplary damages.
- It is hereby alleged pursuant to CPLR 1603 that the foregoing cause of action is 33. exempt from the operation of CPLR 1601 by reason of one or more of the exemptions provided in CPLR 1602, including but not limited to, CPLR 1602(7) and 1602(11).
- 34. That the amount of damages sought exceeds the jurisdictional limits of all lower courts, which would otherwise have jurisdiction.

### AS AND FOR A THIRD CAUSE OF ACTION

### (NEGLIGENT FAILURE TO PROVIDE A SAFE AND SECURE ENVIRONMENT)

- 35. Plaintiff repeats, reiterates, and realleges each and every allegation contained in the above paragraphs of this Complaint, with the same force and effect as if fully set forth at length herein.
- 36. The Defendants DIOCESE and ST. GABRIEL assumed a duty to protect the safety and welfare of Plaintiff as more fully set forth above, when Plaintiff participated as a parishioner in ST. GABRIEL related activities such as confession and counseling provided by COX. This duty imposed upon said Defendants, the duty to provide a reasonably safe and secure environment for Plaintiff while he was participating in parish programs.
- When Plaintiff was in said Defendants' care, said Defendants failed to exercise 37.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 517990/2019 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 08/14/2019

the degree of care that a reasonably prudent parent would have exercised under similar circumstances.

- 38. Defendants DIOCESE and ST. GABRIEL and their agents and employees were negligent, careless and reckless and acted willfully, wantonly and were grossly negligent in failing to provide a safe and secure environment for Plaintiff while he participated as a minor in parish programs and as such were sexually abused by COX.
- 39. By reason of the foregoing, Plaintiff sustained physical and psychological injuries, including but not limited to, severe emotional distress, confusion, humiliation, fright, anxiety, a severe shock to his nervous system, and has been caused to suffer physical pain and mental anguish, emotional and psychological damages as a result thereof, and, upon information and belief, some or all of these injuries are of a permanent and lasing nature; and that Plaintiff as a result has become and will continue to be obligated to expend sums of money for medical expenses for treatment of said maladies.
- That by reason of the foregoing, Defendants DIOCESE and ST. GABRIEL are 40. also liable to Plaintiff for punitive and exemplary damages.
- It is hereby alleged pursuant to CPLR 1603 that the foregoing cause of action is 41. exempt from the operation of CPLR 1601 by reason of one or more of the exemptions provided in CPLR 1602, including but not limited to, CPLR 1602(7) and 1602(11).
- That the amount of damages sought exceeds the jurisdictional limits of all lower 42. courts, which would otherwise have jurisdiction.

8

FILED: KINGS COUNTY CLERK 08/14/2019 12:15 PM

pursuant to the causes of action herein.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 517990/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 08/14/2019

WHEREFORE, the Plaintiff demands judgment against the Defendants, together with compensatory and punitive damages, and the interest, costs and disbursements

Dated: New York, New York August 14, 2019

> MICHAEL G. DOWD Attorney for Plaintiff

600 Third Avenue, 15th Floor

New York, NY 10016

(212) 751-1640

FILED: KINGS COUNTY CLERK 08/14/2019 12:15 PM

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 08/14/2019

INDEX NO. 517990/2019

VERIFICATION BY ATTORNEY

MICHAEL G. DOWD, an attorney being duly admitted before the courts of the State of

New York, hereby affirms the following under penalties of perjury:

That he is an attorney for the Plaintiff in the above-entitled action with offices located at

600 Third Ave, New York, New York; that he has read the foregoing VERIFIED COMPLAINT

and knows the contents thereof; that the same is true to his knowledge, except as to the matters

stated to be alleged upon information and belief, and that as to those matters he believes them to

be true.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

That the reason why this verification is made by deponent instead of Plaintiff is because

Plaintiff is not within the County of New York where deponent has his office. Deponent further

says that the grounds of his belief as to all matters in the VERIFIED COMPLAINT not stated to

be upon his knowledge are based upon conversations with the Plaintiff and other writings

relevant to this action.

Dated: New York, New York

August 14, 2019

MICHAEL G. DOWD

Attorney for Plaintiff

600 Third Avenue, 15th Floor

New York, NY 10016

(212) 751-1640

10

11 of 11